

**CITY OF OREGON CITY  
HISTORIC REVIEW BOARD MEETING MINUTES  
SEPTEMBER 14, 2010**

**City Hall – Commission Chambers  
625 Center Street, Oregon City**

**Board Members Present:**

Chair John McLoughlin  
Ken Baysinger  
Vicki Yates  
Cindy Towle

**Staff Present:**

Christina Robertson-Gardiner, Associate Planner

**1. CALL TO ORDER**

Chair McLoughlin called the meeting to order at ?? p.m.

**2. PUBLIC COMMENT ON ITEMS NOT LISTED ON AGENDA**

There was no public comment on items not listed on the agenda.

**3. HISTORIC REVIEW BOARD HEARINGS**

**HR 10-05 - 22E30DD TL 2901 Adjacent to 519 13th Street--Construction of a New House in the McLoughlin Conservation District**

Chair McLoughlin re-opened the public hearing and read the hearing statement. He asked the Board if there was any conflict of interest or ex parte contact. There was none.

Christina Robertson-Gardiner, Associate Planner, said at the last meeting the applicant provided revised drawings and a 3D elevation. There were some revisions that were entered into the record, Exhibits A and B. She reviewed the revised application. She recommended approval with the conditions that were available at the last meeting and the revisions as submitted by the applicant.

Jim Small of Oregon City explained the proposed windows and half light door.

Chair McLoughlin asked for any public testimony. There was none.

Chair McLoughlin closed the public hearing.

Motion by Ms. Yates, second by Ms. Towle, to approve HR 10-05 with the conditions supported by staff. Motion passed unanimously 4-0.

**HR 10-08 - 1509 10th Street**

Motion by Mr. Baysinger, second by Ms. Yates, to continue HR 10-08 to the meeting of September 28, 2010. Motion passed unanimously 4-0.

## **HR 10-09 - 1008 Jefferson Street**

Chair McLoughlin asked if the Board had any conflict of interest or ex parte contact regarding this application. There was none.

Ms. Robertson-Gardiner said this was an application for approval of an addition of a property within the McLoughlin Conservation District. The two story addition would be a cross gable addition that would take over the side elevation and be incorporated so the existing one story addition would not be seen. She explained the design of the addition and the criteria the applicant did not meet. Staff believed the applicant designed an addition that on its own was historically proportional, well balanced, and mimicked fenestration and details from the historic Emanuel Bushong House. However, the location and size of the addition created a volume that competed with the historic house and created a false sense of history. As proposed staff found that the addition was not compatible with the historic house and recommended denial.

Carrie Richter, City Attorney, explained the previous design advice in July was only advisory and was not binding. Staff made an independent interpretation of the criteria, but the HRB could make a different interpretation and staff was there to implement the HRB's decision.

Ms. Robertson-Gardiner entered Exhibit A into the record, the design advice PowerPoint presentation.

Devlyn Kozol of Oregon City was the applicant. Regarding the letter from neighbor Susan Osborn, Mr. Kozol said if the egress window was not required for the upper story, he would move it. He was willing to build a fence or vegetation for privacy to her property. Mr. Kozol had a growing family and needed additional space. He took into consideration the criteria and geometry of the house and this plan was the only one that was logical and a feasible place to do an addition on the structure.

Chair McLoughlin suggested adding on to the back of the house. Mr. Kozol said that would take a significant piece out of the backyard.

Chair McLoughlin said this addition would make it look like this was how it was when it was built and that was the problem.

Chair McLoughlin asked for public testimony.

Denyse McGriff of Oregon City said she had looked at the house and suggested the applicant research alternatives.

Mr. Baysinger said in July the HRB thought the addition was not highly visible because it was at the end of the road and the streetview did not change as the existing facade remained dominant. The siting reduced the mass of the new addition and his opinion had not changed.

Ms. Yates agreed. The right side of the house was hidden. She thought regarding the neighbor, there were trees that blocked the view through the months that someone would most likely be in the yard. Also the applicant was willing to build a fence to shield the neighbor's privacy. The HRB wanted to promote homeowners such as Mr. Kozol.

Ms. Towle agreed, however she thought the new roof took away from the house. Mr. Kozol explained how the roof was diminished by the landscape.

Chair McLoughlin sketched an alternative for putting the addition to the back of the house.

Ms. McGriff as representative of the McLoughlin Neighborhood Association requested that the hearing be continued as the revised material had not yet been reviewed by the Association due to untimely transmittal of the documents.

Ms. Towle suggested getting the architect's advice for the feasibility of Chair McLoughlin's suggestion. The alternatives could be preliminary.

Mr. Baysinger was inclined to approve the design as it was submitted. He did not think it was necessary for the applicant to come back with alternatives.

Ms. Robertson-Gardiner could have revised findings available at the next meeting.

Motion by Ms. Yates, second by Mr. Baysinger, to continue HR 10-09 to the meeting of September 28, 2010. Motion passed unanimously 4-0.

#### **4. GENERAL BUSINESS**

##### **Ermatinger House Update**

Ms. Robertson-Gardiner said the National Park Service was not able to take over the Ermatinger House at this time. Denise Kai, Assistant Community Services Director, was moving forward with last year's bids for window repair. She would be working with Ms. Kai to make sure the scope of work fit the HRB policies for window repair.

Ms. McGriff explained the National Park Service could not take the house at this time due to the existing fiscal formula and obligations.

Ms. Yates said the National Park Service would be involved in the advice for repairs made to the house and the HRB needed to be kept informed on this issue.

#### **5. ADJOURN**

Chair McLoughlin adjourned the meeting at ?? p.m.